

Y 3. C71/2: 2 / M 66/V. 1 / DOC

Colorado River  
Compact negotiations  
Part 1

missing  
16  
17

1-152

**MINUTES AND RECORD  
OF THE  
FIRST EIGHTEEN SESSIONS  
OF THE  
COLORADO RIVER COMMISSION  
NEGOTIATING THE  
COLORADO RIVER COMPACT OF 1922**

LIBRARY  
Colorado State University  
Fort Collins, Colorado 80526

EXPLANATION OF INDEX

The page numbers appearing in the Index which follows are identical with those shown on the photostatic reproduction of minutes, from which this mimeographed copy was prepared. It will be noted, however, that there are three series of page numbers as follows:

Pages 1 to 152, inclusive (see first and second pages of Index)

Pages 1 to 209, inclusive (see second, third and fourth pages of Index)

Pages 1 to 172, inclusive (see fourth and fifth pages of Index)



U18401 9508227

# MINUTES AND RECORD OF COLORADO RIVER COMMISSION

## \*\* LOG OF TOPICS \*\*

	PAGE
Session No. 1 — Jan. 26, 1922	1
Purpose of meeting	1
Roster of Attendance	1-2
Opening Statement by Herbert Hoover, Secretary of Commerce	2-4
Selection of Hoover as permanent Chairman of Commission	4
Credentials of various states' commissioners	4-14
Statement, Delph E. Carpenter, Colorado Commissioner	15-17
Statement, James E. Scrugham, Nevada State Engineer	19
Statement, Hon. Stephen B. Davis Jr., New Mexico Commissioner	19-20
Statement, W. S. Norviel, Arizona State Water Commissioner	20
Statement, R. E. Caldwell, Utah State Engineer	21
Statement, W. F. McClure, California State Engineer	22
Statement, Frank C. Emerson, Wyoming State Engineer	23-27
Statement, Arthur P. Davis, Director and Chief Engineer of the Reclamation Service	28-33
Comments and questions on Davis' statement	33-39
Statement, O. C. Merrill, Executive Secretary, Federal Power Commission	39-40
Statement, Maj. Gen. Lansing H. Beach, Chief of Engineers, United States War Department	40-41
Comments and questions on Beach statement	41-44
Statement, N. C. Grover, Chief Hydraulic Engineer, Geological Survey	45
Motion to appoint commission committees (carried)	46-47
Additional statement and proposal by W. S. Norviel	49-50
Session No. 2 — Jan. 27, 1922 (2:30 p.m.)	55
Statement, Sen. Key Pittman of Nevada	55-57
Statement, Rep. Swing of California	58
Statement, Rep. Samuel S. Arentz of Nevada	60
Statement, Rep. Henry Z. Osborne of California	61
Session No. 3 — Jan. 27, 1922 (4 p.m.)	63
Session No. 4 — Jan. 28, 1922 (10 a.m.)	64
W. B. Mathews telegram	64-65
Session No. 5 — Jan. 28, 1922 (3 p.m.)	67
Davis-Carpenter instructed to prepare report on legal claims against waters of Colorado River	67
Ottamer Hamele, of Reclamation Service, requested to report on setting up permanent board of control	67-68
Session No. 6 — Jan. 30, 1922 (10 a.m.)	69
Table A — Estimates of areas and water requirements	69-70
Table B — Water Requirements for New Acres	71
Table C — Water Requirements for Cultivated Acres	72
Discussion and comments on tables and figures	73-76
Revised Table B	77
Revised Table C	78
Davis Formula as basis for Agreement	79-80
Davis Formula not approved	81
Chairman's proposition to vest full authority in Colorado River Commission	81
Chairman's proposal fails to get unanimous approval	81

missing  
16-17

# Log of Topics - Continued

PAGE

George Otis Smith letter re gaging summaries	82
Map, Colorado River Drainage Basin	83
Drainage statistics, Colorado River drainage basin	84-89
Green River at Green River, Wyoming	84
Green River near Bridgeport, Utah	84
Yampa River near Maybell, Colorado	85
Duchesne River at Myton, Utah	85
Uinta River at Fort Duchesne	85
Green River at Green River, Utah	86
San Rafael River near Green River, Utah	86
Grand River near Moat and Cisco, Utah	87
Grand River near Fruita, Colorado	87
San Juan River at Farmington, N. Mexico	87
Animas River at Farmington, N. Mexico	87
San Juan River near Bluff, Utah	88
Little Colorado River near Holbrook, Arizona	88
Virgin River at Virgin, Utah	88
Colorado River near Topock, Arizona	88
Colorado River at Yuma, Arizona	89
Gila River at Guthrie, Arizona	89
San Francisco River at Clifton Arizona	89
Annual Runoffs, Principal Gaging Stations in Colorado River Basin	90
Session No. 7 -- Jan. 30, 1922 (2:30 p.m.)	91
Hoover draft of constructive plan in general terms	95
Comments and discussion	96
Carpenter proposal for general position for compact	105
Comments and discussion	113
McClure Proposal re Early Construction	125
Norviel Proposal re Development Limitations	127
Comments and Discussion	129
Motion to adopt Norviel proposal	133
Motion lost 4-3 on roll call	133
Hoover revision of Development Limitations proposal	134
Wyoming's position re Early Construction	135
Comments and Discussion	137
Hoover analysis of conference progress, differences	141
Comments and discussion	141
Motion to adjourn to earliest possible date	152
Motion to adjourn (carried)	152

Note: Page Numbers again start at No. 1

Session No. 8 -- March 15, 1922	1
Roster of Attendance	1
Schedule of Hearings	1-2
Merrill letter re Dam at Diamond Creek	2

Log of Topics - Continued

PAGE

Session No. 9 — April 1, 1922

Roster of Attendance 5  
 Resolution for transcript of records of previous hearings (adopted) 5  
 Resolution calling for suggested forms of compact (adopted) 5  
 Resolution approving previous minutes (adopted) 6  
 Postponement of acting re Dam at Diamond Creek 6

Session No. 10 — Nov. 9, 1922

Roster of Attendance 7  
 Resolution to recess, to await late arrivals (adopted) 7  
 Resolution inviting Governors to attend executive sessions (adopted) 7  
 Resolution for legal and engineering advisors (adopted) 7  
 Resolution re Davis and Hamele attendance (adopted) 8  
 Resolution re poll on states' briefs and statements (adopted) 8  
 Resolution re reception of states' statements (adopted) 8

Session No. 11 -- Nov. 11, 1922

Roster of Attendance 9  
 Consideration of Methods of Procedure 11  
 Arizona Recommendations on Procedure 12-17  
 Comments and Discussion 18  
 California, no recommendations 20  
 Colorado Recommendations on Procedure 20-28  
 Comments and discussion 29  
 New Mexico, no recommendations 31-32  
 Nevada, no recommendations 32  
 Caldwell comments, recommendations 32-36  
 Comments and discussion 36  
 Carpenter analysis of compact needs 45  
 Abandonment of discussion of states' water apportionments 54  
 Discussion of diversion between groups of states 54  
 G. H. Hoodenpyl recommendations re compact 63-64  
 Comments and discussion 64-70

Session No. 12 — Nov. 12, 1922

Roster of Attendance 71  
 Continued discussion re diversion between groups of states 71  
 Roll call favoring establishing division between upper and lower states 93

Session No. 13 - Nov. 13, 1922 (10 a.m.)

Roster of Attendance 95  
 Arizona Acceptance of group of states diversion principle 96  
 Division point at Lee's Ferry, including the Paria 110  
 Discussion of averaging stream flow 110  
 Norviel statement on diversion possibilities 131  
 Discussion and comment 139

Log of Topics -- Continued

PAGE

Session No. 14 -- Nov. 13, 1922 (3 p.m.)	147
Roster of Attendance	147
Maxwell communication (National Reclamation Association)	148-151
Motion to admit L. Ward Bannister to meetings (carried)	152
Discussion of time limit on compact revisions	152-209

Note: Page Numbers again start at No. 1

Session No. 15 -- Nov. 14, 1922 (10 a.m.)	1
Roster of Attendance	1
Motion to admit A. J. McCune to meetings (carried)	2
Hoover summary of arguments to date	2
Motion for 5 million acre feet flow yearly past Lee's Ferry	33
Amendment for 4 million, 500 thousand acre feet (not accepted)	33
Roll call on original Scrugham motion (lost)	34-35
Scrugham modification to 4 million, 500 thousand acre feet	35
Roll call on modified minimum flow	37-40
McClure motion for 4 million acre feet minimum	40
Roll call on McClure motion	41
Norviel motion to set five-year study period	44
Roll call on five-year period (lost)	45
Carpenter motion for ten-year period	47
Call for approximation of flow at Lee's Ferry	56

Session No. 16 -- Nov. 14, 1922 (3 p.m.)	58
Roster of Attendance	58
Davis Report on Flow at Lee's Ferry	74
Hoover recap on figures on Lee's Ferry Flow	82
Hoover offer to consolidate views of north-south groups	87

Session No. 17 -- Nov. 15, 1922	89
Roster of Attendance	89
Davis statement for northern group states	90
Comments, Norviel, McClure, Davis	94-99
Recap on minimum flow, 5-year basis	101
Discussion and questions	102

Session No. 18 -- Nov. 16, 1922	114
Roster of Attendance	114
Hoover Report on Rough Principles of Agreement	115
Motion to adopt paragraph defining Colorado River Basin area in the United States (carried)	116
Motion to adopt paragraph setting basin division at point immediately below mouth of Paria (carried)	117
Introduction of paragraph providing for creation of new commission	118
Motion to adopt paragraph as revised (carried)	122-123
Introduction of paragraph defining priority on water rights and uses	123
Motion to adopt paragraph, subject to revision in final pact (carried)	135
Introduction of paragraph setting up to 7,500,000 acre feet annually for each division	136
Motion to adopt paragraph for 7,500,000 acre feet (carried)	137-138
Introduction of paragraph on establishing rights to beneficial use after expiration of period	138-139
Motion to adopt paragraph as revised (carried)	140

# MINUTES AND RECORD OF COLORADO RIVER COMMISSION

## -- LOG OF MEETINGS --

<u>Session No.</u>	<u>Date</u>	<u>Place</u>	<u>Page</u>
1	Jan. 26, 1922	Department of Commerce Washington, D. C.	1
2	Jan. 27, 1922	Department of Commerce Washington, D. C.	55
3	Jan. 27, 1922	Department of Commerce Washington, D. C.	63
4	Jan. 28, 1922	Department of Commerce Washington, D. C.	64
5	Jan. 28, 1922	Department of Commerce Washington, D. C.	67
6	Jan. 30, 1922	Department of Commerce Washington, D. C.	69
7	Jan. 30, 1922	Department of Commerce Washington, D. C.	91

\*\*\*\*\*

Note: Page Numbers again start at No. 1

\*\*\*\*\*

8	March 15, 1922	Federal Building Phoenix, Arizona	1
9	April 1, 1922	Brown Palace Hotel Denver, Colorado	5
10	Nov. 9, 1922	Bishop's Lodge Santa Fe, N. Mex.	7
11	Nov. 11, 1922	Bishop's Lodge Santa Fe, N. Mex.	9
12	Nov. 12, 1922	Bishop's Lodge Santa Fe, N. Mex.	71
13	Nov. 13, 1922	Bishop's Lodge Santa Fe, N. Mex.	95
14	Nov. 14, 1922	Bishop's Lodge Santa Fe, N. Mex.	147

Log of Meetings - Continued

Note: Page Numbers again start at No. 1

15	Nov. 14, 1922	Bishop's Lodge Santa Fe, N. Mex.	1
16	Nov. 14, 1922	Bishop's Lodge Santa Fe, N. Mex.	58
17	Nov. 15, 1922	Bishop's Lodge Santa Fe, N. Mex.	89
18	Nov. 16, 1922	Bishop's Lodge Santa Fe, N. Mex.	114



## FOREWORD

This is a mimeographed reproduction of the minutes of eighteen meetings or sessions of the Commission which negotiated the Colorado River Compact. The Compact was signed in Santa Fe, New Mexico, on the 24th day of November, 1922. Subsequently it was ratified by all of the seven Colorado River Basin States and, in 1928, approved by the Congress of the United States.

There were in all twenty-seven sessions held by the Commission as follows:

First to Seventh, Washington, D. C., January 26-30, 1922;  
Eighth, Phoenix, Arizona, March 15, 1922; Ninth, Denver, Colorado  
April 1, 1922; Tenth to Twenty-seventh, Bishop's Lodge, Santa Fe,  
New Mexico, November 9-24, 1922.

The minutes of the first eighteen sessions are included in this volume. Those for the Nineteenth to the Twenty-seventh sessions, inclusive, are not now available.

This mimeographed reproduction was prepared from a photostatic copy of the minutes supplied by the Bureau of Reclamation, Department of the Interior. A note from the Bureau of Reclamation concerning these photostatic copies, from which this mimeographed copy was prepared, states:

"NOTE:

"Data on the preceding image indicates that there were a total of twenty-seven (27) meetings of the Commission. This record concludes with the minutes of the eighteenth (18) meeting.

"Correspondence and search conducted in 1940 and 1941 failed to result in the location of the original minutes of the Commission or of another copy of the minutes which would permit the completion of the record.

Bureau of Reclamation"

This mimeographed copy is as nearly an exact reproduction of the above mentioned photostatic copy as possible and sets forth on each mimeograph page only the material which appears on the corresponding photostatic page,

including all corrections and insertions. Each page has been carefully read and compared with the original photostatic copy. The page numbers are those shown on the photostats, and it will be noted that there are three series of page numbers as follows:

Pages 1 to 152, inclusive (see first and second pages  
of Index)  
Pages 1 to 209, inclusive (see second, third and fourth  
pages of Index)  
Pages 1 to 172, inclusive (see fourth and fifth pages  
of Index)

It will be observed that the note from the Bureau of Reclamation, above quoted, states that "correspondence and search conducted in 1940 and 1941 failed to result in the location of the original minutes of the Commission....."

A letter, dated May 3, 1948, from the National Archives, Washington D. C., states:

"This is in reply to your letter of April 12 requesting information as to the location of the original minutes of the Colorado River Compact Commission.

"We have searched the records of the Reclamation Bureau, the National Resources Planning Board, and the Department of Commerce, which are in the National Archives, and have been unable to find these minutes. The Weather Bureau, the Geological Survey, and the Department of Commerce have had searches made among records retained by them and have likewise been unable to find the minutes "" "" "

In recent years inquiry and search made by various persons for the original or a copy of all of the minutes of the Colorado River Compact Commission have failed to bear results. Such search has extended to available files of some of the compact commissioners.

The appendix contained in the book entitled "Colorado River Basin - The Colorado River Compact", by Reuel Leslie Olson, under the heading "Bibliography", Page 503, contains a copy of a letter from S. B. Davis, then Acting Secretary of Commerce, dated October 16, 1924, which reads:

Department of Commerce  
Office of the Secretary  
Washington

"Mr. R. L. Olson  
Cambridge, Mass.  
Dear Sir:

October 16, 1924

The minutes of the various meetings of the Colorado River Commission have not been completely edited or arranged, but they are all of them available here and you may have access to them at any time that you desire.

Very truly yours,  
(Signed) S. B. Davis  
Acting Secretary of Commerce"

It is observed that Mr. Olson quotes from minutes of the Colorado River Compact Commission sessions later than the eighteenth. All, or at least a considerable part, of these minutes which now appear to be unavailable must have been reviewed by him between October 1924, when the S. B. Davis letter was written, and September 1926, when his book was published. However, recent inquiry has failed to reveal any further information respecting his study of these minutes or concerning the location, extent and condition in which he found them.

.....

CSU -3015  
Fred Schmidt  
Documents Lib.

Date sent

10/10  
NOV 10 '00

DUE

Mesa State College Library

10/06/2000 2:42 PM

Full Record

<http://www.marmot.org:1096/cgi-bin/cjs?fullRecord+5327+108+766038+1+1>

PLEASE RETURN THIS  
FORM WITH BOOK

**MESA**

STATE

COLLEGE

**Tomlinson Library**

MESA STATE COLLEGE

[Back to Title List](#)

PERSONAL LIST  
MANAGER

[Add this record to list](#)

[Review Search History](#)

[Save record\(s\) to disk](#)

[Email record\(s\)](#)

[Request item from  
interlibrary loan](#)

[Display print version](#)

Database: Mesa State College

Search type: Title Browse

Search was: minutes and record of the colorado river  
comm

[Next](#)

Corporate Author Colorado River Commission.

Title Minutes and record ... of the Colorado River Commission  
negotiating the Colorado River Compact of 1922.

Publisher [S.L.] : The Commission. [1922?]

Description 2 v. : 28 cm.

Notes Cover title.

Contents [1] First eighteen sessions -- [2] Sessions nineteen thru  
twenty seven.

Subjects Colorado River Commission.

Colorado River Compact Commission.

Water rights Colorado River (Colorado-Mexico)

Colorado River (Colorado-Mexico)

### Full Status

Branch	Location	Date	Call Number	Status
Special Collections		07/18/92	HD1695.C7 C65 v.1	Library use only On
Special Collections		07/18/92	HD1695.C7 C65 v.2	Library use only On

[Next](#)

Vote on paragraph leaving whole remaining flow of basin for future determination (carried)	146
Introduction of paragraph defining responsibility of both basins in providing Mexico's share of Colorado River water	146
Vote on paragraph as revised (carried)	146
Introduction of paragraph on establishment of technical commission to collect data	147
Vote on paragraph as revised (carried)	149
Introduction of paragraph relating to diversions or storage between states	150
Motion to adopt paragraph as revised	164
Motion to establish 50-year period	166
Amendment for 40-year period	166
Motion for period to extend to June 30, 1963	167
Withdrawal of original motion for 50-year period (lost)	167
Vote on renewed proposal for 50-year period	168
Motion to consider date between June 30, 1963 and June 30, 1973 to be determined by chair and accepted by members of commission	168
Setting of June 30, 1868 as accepted date (45 years)	170
Motion to adopt June 30 as beginning date for 10-year calculations (carried)	170-171
Motion to appoint drafting committee (carried)	171
Appointment of drafting committee	171
Motion to include chairman as ex-officio member of committee (carried)	172